THE COMMUNITY RESEARCH PROJECT

SUMMARY OF A REPORT PREPARED BY COLIN H. WILLIAMS
AND JEREMY EVAS
DEPARTMENT OF WELSH
UNIVERSITY OF WALES, CARDIFF
FOR THE WELSH LANGUAGE BOARD

AUGUST 1997

Copyright:
Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg/ Welsh Language Board, 1997

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or
by any other means, without permission in writing from the publishers.

ISBN 0 9527533 5 9

Colin H. Williams is Research Professor and Jeremy Evas is a researcher in
the Department of Welsh, University of Wales, Cardiff. They would like to
thank all those who contributed to this research project. They are cited
individually in the acknowledgments section of the main report.
The Community Research Project

A summary of community research conducted in Mold and the Teifi, Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys

CONTENTS

1. Introduction
   1.1. Background
   1.2. The Brief
   1.3. Data collection methods

2. The research results
   2.1. Mold and its environs
   2.2. The Teifi Valley
   2.3. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys: Cwm Gwendraeth
   2.4. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys: The Aman Valley
   2.5. The Main Findings of the Field Work

3. Linguistic Intervention: Effective Intervention?
   3.1. Mold and district
   3.2. Teifi Valley
   3.3. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys
   3.4. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth
   3.5. Menter Aman Tawe
3.6. Conclusion


4.1. The Welsh Speaking Community?
4.2. Mentrau Iaith to strengthen Welsh
4.3. The Framework

5. Other methods of intervention

5.1. Language initiatives at the county level: the case of Carmarthenshire
5.2. County Language Resource Centres.
5.3. A National Language Resource Centre
5.4. Language Animateurs

6. Realising the Potential

6.1. What are the main barriers to Welsh in the workplace?
6.2. What is to be done?
6.3. Changing attitudes

7. Recommendations

7.1. The Principal Recommendations
7.2. Other recommendations

1. Introduction

1.1. Background

1.1.1. In its Strategy for the Welsh Language which was published in December 1996, the Welsh Language Board identified four main challenges facing the Welsh language:

- increasing the number of people who are able to speak Welsh
- providing opportunities to use the language
- changing the habits of language use, and encouraging people to take advantage of the opportunities provided
- strengthening Welsh as a community language
1.1.2. This research project was commissioned specifically to obtain answers to the fourth challenge, that is, *strengthening Welsh as a community language*. However, the research also contributes to our understanding of those factors which affect the language situation in general and is therefore relevant to the implementation of the Strategy in its entirety.

1.2.3 In this Summary, we report on the main findings of the research undertaken between January 1996 and March 1997. The principal results of the data analysis are noted, together with their implications for community language planning. The complete version of the research report will shortly be available on the respective World Wide Web sites of the Welsh Language Board and of the University of Wales Cardiff.

1.2 The Brief

1.2.1. The aim of the research was to investigate, on a comparative basis, the use of Welsh in the Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys, the region served by Antur Teifi, together with Mold and its environs, and to suggest practical ways of increasing the use of Welsh throughout Wales.

1.2.2. Specifically, the work probes into the weaknesses of those social agents which maintain the language in order to discover how individuals and language agents may be able to devise strategies to overcome the lack of daily contact between Welsh speakers in recognised spheres and social contexts.

1.2.3. The research was based on the following questions:

- if the old social situations no longer maintain Welsh to the same extent as they did formerly, are there new situations which can be created to strengthen the use of the language in the community?
- if there are, what are they?
- who should establish and manage them?
- how should they be financed: privately or publicly or in a partnership?
- should they rise naturally from within the community or should they be established by local or central government e.g. in the shape of Cultural Resource Centres?
- should establishing and managing these new networks as part of the process of 'language intervention' be part of the remit of Antur Teifi, Menter Cwm Gwendraeth and Menter Aman Tawe?
- in order to effectively intervene in the situation of the language, is
there a greater need for specific detailed data on the use made of Welsh?

1.2.4 Research was also undertaken within the following language-related contexts:

- on a personal level e.g. whilst reading, watching television, at home and with the family;
- in an informal social setting e.g. leisure time, with neighbours and co-workers;
- in a formal social setting within the private sector e.g. in a shop, bank, or with specific companies.
- in a more formal social setting, in dealings with 'the establishment' e.g. the local council, the education authority, hospital and the doctor.

1.2.5 In the case of the latter two elements, the research seeks to identify how *diglossia* (which literally means bilingualism, but which can also suggest how in a community setting it is possible to use two languages in different specified domains) effects the predisposition of an individual to speak, read and write Welsh rather than English. In analysing the research results, consideration was given to what effect significant changes in the spheres of education, the media and the public sector had on the behaviour and expectations which people held in regards to the use of the language.

1.2.6 Information was collected on the current networks available to Welsh speakers in the study areas, in order to demonstrate:

- which networks maintain the Welsh language;
- if a network is unavailable, what effect does this have on the user;
- how practicable is it to change the provision;
- do the users wish to change the situation;
- which considerations predispose people not to use Welsh in a network when it is possible so to do;
- what could be done to cause them to change their behaviour.

1.2.7 In the light of this, the following was considered:

- which networks are desirable and practicable;
- which networks are desirable but impracticable;
- which networks are essential given the statutory obligations of the Welsh Language Act (1993) and of Local Government reform (April 1996).
1.2.8 Linguistic intervention and normalisation are the principal themes of this research. It was therefore necessary to examine the effect of intervention in the areas served by Mentrau Iaith (local language initiatives). It must be asked, which is the more practicable, short-term or medium-term intervention? If short-term, and related to the work of the Mentrau iaith, are they appropriate and sufficiently flexible to undertake the task? Similarly, we need to ask what would be the effect of not intervening in the linguistic situation thereby allowing the process of normalisation of the use of the Welsh language to progress naturally.

### 1.3. The study areas

1.3.1 The rationale for the selection of the three study areas is as follows.

**Mold**

1.3.2 Mold has a low proportion of Welsh speakers and is characteristic of a number of urban areas in Wales where English is the predominant medium of communication. Welsh speakers constitute a minority in the community, and they have not experienced any specific language intervention. Notwithstanding this, Mold is a strategic administrative centre and measures to promote Welsh could have a significant impact upon its language use patterns. The research results for Mold should prove of relevance to comparable areas throughout north-east and south-east Wales.

**The Teifi Valley**

1.3.3 As part of the 'traditional Welsh heartland', it was expected that Welsh would be the main language for the overwhelming majority of the population of the Teifi Valley. The area has recently experienced a considerable degree of social and economic change, including a significant level of in-migration by non-Welsh speakers, together, to a lesser extent, with an out-flow of Welsh-speaking residents. Hitherto, economic intervention, rather than specific linguistic intervention has been evident in this region, and that under the auspices of Antur Teifi, an economic development agency established to reverse the economic decline of the area. Antur Teifi is one of the few private sector ventures which have adopted Welsh as their main medium of communication, reflective of the linguistic character of the area served by the Antur.

**Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys**
1.3.4 These valleys have a high proportion of Welsh speakers. In common with many other industrial areas, the community has suffered under the dual effects of unemployment and poverty. Specifically, it is particularly evident that many of the old networks which previously supported Welsh have been severely weakened, although some new ones have emerged. However, these have not been sufficiently robust to guarantee a self-sustaining language community. In an attempt to halt the erosion of the Welsh language, two Mentrau Iaith were established at the beginning of the 1990s. The Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys were selected as sample sites in the research project in order to investigate the direct impact of these pioneering language enterprise agencies. The concept of a Menter Iaith is quite familiar by now, but little is known in detail of whether their impact is successful or not. From the beginning, both Menter Cwm Gwendraeth and Menter Aman Tawe have concentrated on different aspects of the process off reviving Welsh in the community, and this as a consequence offers an opportunity to examine different methods of language intervention within relatively similar linguistic contexts.

1.4. Data collection methods

1.4.1. The sample is comprised of adults aged 17 and over. A specially tailored questionnaire which had a common core of questions focusing on the issues itemised below was used to collect data on the sample's use of language in the three study areas (a copy of the questionnaire may be found in the appendix of the main report):

- the use of Welsh and English in the three study areas;
- an assessment of the language skills of the population of those areas;
- the respondents' wishes in respect of a more comprehensive use of Welsh;
- the respondents' educational and occupational background by language status;
- the linguistic structure of the respondents' families;
- a description of how easy it was to use Welsh within different domains;
- which language the respondents would prefer to use within these specified domains;
- the practical use of Welsh;
- an assessment of the respondents' self-confidence when using Welsh;
- the number of people who take the opportunity to use the current bilingual provision.
1.4.2. The respondents were then asked their views about items which were specific to their locale. Thus in the case of Mold they were asked about the potential to intervene in the situation of the language in the area, whilst in the Teifi Valley attention focused on the activities of Antur Teifi. In the Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys, the focus was on the role and effect of the Mentrau Iaith.

1.4.3. Finally, respondents were questioned with regard to a number of items deriving from recent developments which have increased the status of the Welsh language and its public profile.

1.4.4. In order to secure a qualitative as well as a quantitative response, as many questionnaires as possible were completed in a face to face interview. In addition, some local respondents were allowed to complete the questionnaire in their own time. An opportunity was provided at the end of the questionnaire for respondents to raise any issue they felt had not been adequately covered. The final report documents these observations at the end of each study area's results section.

1.4.5. The research data is compiled from 563 individual interviews which comprise the final total sample. Mold and district generated 95 respondents, the Teifi Valley 218 respondents, Cwm Gwendraeth, 163 and the Aman Valley 87 respondents. Consequently a comprehensive and substantial data base was constructed which contained 97,400 data values (17,765 data values in Mold; 36,406 in the Teifi Valley; 27,221 in Cwm Gwendraeth and 16,008 in the case of Cwm Aman). A summary of the main results only is provided in this report. More detailed statistical analysis may be found in the main report.

2. The research results

2.1. Mold and its environs

Results

Family composition

- 27% of the sample spoke Welsh as a mother tongue; 39% of the sample spoke Welsh to varying degrees.
70% of the Welsh speaking respondents were married or had partners, of whom only 39% were able to speak Welsh.

20.6% of the eldest children of the total sample spoke Welsh.

It appears that a significant minority of the children of Welsh speakers were unable to speak Welsh.

28% of Welsh speakers lived in households where they were the only member able to speak the language.

It is both interesting and significant to note that some non-Welsh speaking parents choose a Welsh-medium education for their children, while some Welsh speaking parents have chosen not to transmit the language to their children.

**Linguistic skills**

- 28% of mother tongue Welsh speakers declared that their preferred language for writing was Welsh. A similar proportion of this group declared that they would prefer to write in English.
- Only 12% of Welsh speakers preferred to read only or most frequently in Welsh. 44% of the same group said they preferred to read in English most often or only.
- 54% of Welsh speakers noted that their written Welsh was either good or very good, compared with 96% who said that their written English was good or very good.

**Social domains and the use of Welsh**

- In practice, English was the sole medium used by the vast majority of Welsh speakers in the 19 situations which were investigated. The main exceptions to this trend were in dealing with teachers or in using the library service.
- 77% of Welsh speakers would be happy to use Welsh in a cross-section of normal social situations if it were possible;
- 64% of Welsh speakers maintained that the lack of opportunities to use Welsh infringed on their rights as citizens;
- 67% of Welsh speakers were not conscious of any particularly significant erosion of the situation of the language in the community.

**Conclusions**

2.1.1 Often a lack of confidence or of ownership of the language is held to be responsible for the failure to transmit the language to the next
generation, and such a lack of confidence is a notable feature among Welsh speakers in Mold, especially in relation to reading and writing the language. As might be expected this is a more serious deficiency among the second-language group.

2.1.2. Traditionally, the family served as the principal agency for the transmission of Welsh but it is evident that in Mold the education system has an increasingly important contribution to make in this respect.

2.1.3. The existing Welsh-medium networks are insufficient to meet the needs of all the population.

2.1.4. The profile of Welsh is lower than it could be in Mold, and the potential for increasing the use of Welsh is not being realised.

2.1.5. The actual use of Welsh does not reflect the language choice preferences expressed in the data: both learners and fluent speakers maintained that their use of Welsh would increase if opportunities were provided for them.

2.1.6. Currently there is a lack of opportunities to use the language within the private sector. There is an obvious potential for increased investment opportunities to use the language in this sector and in many other specific domains.

2.1.7. The awareness of a lack of language rights is very evident in the area.

2.1.8. The language is perceived to be either under siege or an irrelevant issue for the majority in Mold and its environs. It is limited to a small number of social networks which do not attract large numbers of Welsh speakers, let alone the majority of the non-Welsh speaking residents of the area.

2.1.9. Despite this, there is a great potential in Mold for expanding the use of Welsh. One of the principal reasons for the fragile position of the language is the lack of provision for its use and not a lack of desire on the part of its speakers. This became evident when considering the following elements of the research:

- the contemporary use of Welsh under 'difficult' linguistic circumstances;
- the number of respondents who supported measures such as a reduction in taxes to encourage companies to offer new bilingual...
services;
- the number of respondents who favoured the incorporation of the interests of Welsh within the town and country planning system;
- the number of respondents who favoured bilingual advertising in the area;
- the significant number of respondents who felt that the inferior status of Welsh in the area impinged on their rights as citizens;
- the number of respondents who maintained that they would use Welsh more often were additional opportunities for its use created.

2.1.10. It became evident whilst conducting the field work that several elements of the traditional antipathy felt by non Welsh speakers towards Welsh had weakened in the recent period, principally because of changes in the education system, the media and because of the attempt to increase the status of Welsh. This bodes well for the future as attempts to promote and regenerate Welsh depend on the ready co-operation of the majority of Welsh residents who do not, as yet, speak Welsh.

2.1.11. As the Mold region is similar in socio-linguistic terms to a number of other areas in Wales, we believe that our interpretation (and thus the recommendations to be found at the end of the report) are relevant to long Anglicised parts of Wales, which by today have a relatively low density of Welsh speakers. Mold is relatively fortunate in that its Welsh-medium networks are well established. It is quite another matter to enquire into what extent these networks are sufficient to serve the interests of Welsh speakers in the area. We fear that the contemporary networks are not adequate even for all groups within the Welsh speaking community, let alone the area's non-Welsh speaking majority. The central message is that there is a strong will to extend the use of Welsh in Mold and its surroundings. The next step is to increase the availability of opportunities which are bilingual in character, and by so doing, establish behaviour patterns which will normalise the use of Welsh in a number of the area's social domains.

2.2. The Teifi Valley

Results

Family composition

- Welsh was the mother tongue of 52.5% of the sample; a second language for 21.5%, whilst 4% have learned Welsh as adults; thus 78% of the sample were able to speak Welsh.
39% of the sample were married or had a partner. Of these 76% of Welsh speakers had a Welsh speaking partner.

59% of the eldest children in the total sample could speak Welsh.

A significant minority (22%) of the eldest children of mother tongue speakers had a less fluent command of Welsh than their parents.

There were no other Welsh speakers in the households of 22% of the total sample, 7% of the mother tongue group, 24% of the second-language group, and 56% of the non-Welsh speaking respondents.

**Linguistic skills**

- 20% of Welsh speakers responded that they would prefer to write in Welsh. 50% of the same group said they would prefer to write in English.
- 17% of Welsh speakers said they would prefer to read only or mainly in Welsh. 55% of the same group said they would prefer to read only or mainly in English. The remainder declared that they did not mind in which of the two languages they read.
- 72% of Welsh speakers said that their written Welsh was either quite good or very good, compared with 89% of the same group who said that their written English was either quite or very good.
- The mother tongue group's self-assessment of their Welsh speaking, listening, reading and writing skills is encouraging; on average over 80% of them declared that their Welsh skills were either quite good or very good.

The language skills of Welsh speakers in the Teifi Valley appear to be very good and offer a particularly favourable base for developing Welsh-medium services.

**Social domains and the use of Welsh.**

- The majority of Welsh speakers used Welsh for half or more than half the time in the 19 social situations which were investigated. The main exceptions to this tendency concerned the use of social and health-related services, and with managers in the workplace.
- Over 90% of mother tongue speakers would be happy to use more Welsh in a cross-section of common social situations if it were possible for them so to do. However the figures for the second language group tended more towards English.
- 73% of mother tongue speakers judged that the lack of opportunities to use Welsh impinged on their rights as citizens. In addition, 65% of
these and 78% of the second language group claimed that this lack of provision effected their self-confidence in using Welsh in public.

- On average, 11% of the total sample believed that the use of Welsh was on the increase in the Teifi Valley whilst 12% believed that it was decreasing. A larger proportion (25%) believed that the fortunes of Welsh were fairly stable in the area.

It was noted that in-migration was a factor which greatly effected the socio-linguistic situation of the area. 58% of the total sample was born in the study area; 28% were born outside Wales.

Conclusions

2.2.1. The linguistic foundations of the mother tongue group in the Teifi Valley are fairly solid, although there is scope for their strengthening; however, it appears from the data that the foundations of the second-language group are not so secure.

2.2.2. Our empirical results suggest that language shift from Welsh to English continues in the Teifi Valley.

2.2.3. The data suggests that there is a comparative paucity of opportunities to use Welsh when dealing with the social and health-related services, and with managers in workplaces in the Teifi Valley.

2.2.4. A particular challenge is posed by the second-language group's relative lack of habit and desire to use Welsh for both reading and writing.

2.2.5. The effect of some high schools in the region, which are to all intents and purposes English medium (because of the large number of non-Welsh speaking people who have moved into the area to live) is deleterious for the following reasons:

- A minority of mother tongue Welsh speakers are educated in these schools through the medium of English, and some of these assert that they do not feel part of the area's Welsh speaking networks.
- The second-language students in these schools do not have sufficient opportunity to immerse themselves within a totally Welsh-medium environment.

2.2.6. It is significant to note that a large proportion of the Welsh speaking groups in the Teifi Valley believe that the lack of opportunity to use Welsh impinges upon their rights as citizens.
2.2.7. There was little evidence of conscious marketing of the Welsh language within the Teifi Valley.

2.2.8. There were indications of tension between the different language groups in the community and some insinuated that two parallel communities were developing in the area, one being Welsh-medium and the other English-medium. A substantial proportion of the non-Welsh speaking group felt to be linguistically isolated, as there was no one else in their household who spoke Welsh.

2.2.9. It is evident that there is a great potential to extend the introduction of Welsh into further domains in the area. The overwhelming majority of mother tongue speakers use the language naturally in daily situations, although in general the second language group use it a little less frequently. The chief barrier to the expansion of the use of Welsh in the valley is the lack of any specialist provision. It follows that one may presume that, as in the case of Mold and district, there would be a considerable increase in the use of Welsh were there a corresponding strengthening of its status and the degree of official support it received.

2.2.10. The data suggests that there is considerable support in the Teifi Valley for multifaceted language intervention. A majority of the total sample believed that Welsh should be considered as an issue in town and country planning (69.9%) and there was significant backing for the idea that companies who initiate and sustain bilingual services should qualify for a reduction in their taxes (56.5%). From analysing these questions according to language group, it is evident that the greatest support originates from within the mother tongue groups and to a lesser extent second language groups, while the non-Welsh speaking groups tend to evince slightly lower levels of support. One may conclude that in order to incorporate the whole community within a language regeneration programme there is a particular need for a campaign which focuses on winning the hearts and minds of the non-Welsh speaking groups.

2.2.11. As was the case in the other study areas the overwhelming majority of respondents in the Teifi Valley had not heard of the existence of dedicated Welsh-medium phone help lines.

2.2.12. The community foundations of Welsh are far stronger in the Teifi Valley than was the case in Mold and district, yet despite their comparative strength, many challenges threaten these foundations. One of the principal challenges is the continuous in migration of non-Welsh speaking
individuals and families. The majority of in-migrants in the sample are not of retirement age and many of them have moved from other parts of Wales and not just from England as some critics choose to believe. The education system is doing its best to incorporate the children of such in-migrants within a Welsh context, but as is often noted within the main report, these children tend to appropriate and identify with the Welsh language far less than do their equivalents among first language speakers. This relatively recent second language phenomenon poses a considerable challenge to policy formulators both within the Teifi Valley and in comparable locations elsewhere in Wales.

2.2.13. Another fact which could cause concern for those seeking to reverse the community language shift away from Welsh is the number of adults learning the language. From a non-Welsh speaking total of 153,042 in the former county of Dyfed, only 2,606 (1.7% of the non Welsh speaking population) registered for Welsh for Adults courses in 1992-93 (latest figures available). We do not know what proportion of this group became fluent in Welsh but we may presume that it was a very small minority. In our main recommendations we emphasise the need for a thorough investigation of the linguistic fate of learners.

2.2.14. Antur Teifi, established in 1980 to promote the economic development of the area, succeeded in presenting a largely positive image to the respondents - only a small minority (8.7%) considered Antur Teifi to be irrelevant to the needs of the local population and a large number believed that it should either develop a training programme for local entrepreneurs or become the co-ordinating body for the promotion of Welsh in the community. We consider this further in the next section.

2.2.15. The position of Welsh in the Teifi Valley is one of the liveliest in Wales but it is still facing a persistent and multifaceted threat. There is a way of building on the strong linguistic foundations and to secure them for the future by intervening in the region's socio-economic processes, and some of the measures we recommend are appropriate both for this area and for the whole of Wales. The damaging change to the fortunes of the Welsh language in the Teifi Valley should not be considered as an inevitable trend, but rather as a challenge to be faced squarely.

2.3. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys: Cwm Gwendraeth

It was decided to investigate Cwm Gwendraeth and Cwm Aman separately in order to take advantage of the rich variety of their linguistic situations.
and in order to deal effectively with the socio-economic differences in the valleys. This allows the research to consider the effects of a number of factors on community development within two comparable areas, particularly the impact of establishing Mentrau Iaith (language enterprise initiatives) to re-invigorate Welsh as a community language.

**Results**

**Family composition**

- Welsh was the mother tongue of 81% of the sample; a second language for 12%, while 1% had learned Welsh in adulthood; thus 94% of the sample were able to speak Welsh.
- 50% of the sample were married or had a partner. 90% of the mother tongue Welsh speakers had a Welsh speaking partner.
- 62% of the sample only used Welsh in the home while a further 14.5% used Welsh most frequently.

It should be noted that the research revealed that the family unit operated as an effective agency of language transmission in Cwm Gwendraeth.

**Linguistic skills**

- 27% of the sample stated that they preferred writing in Welsh. 46% of the sample stated that they preferred writing in English. The corresponding figures for the mother tongue speakers are 33% (Welsh), and 35% (English). 32% of the sample stated that they did not mind in which of the two languages they wrote.
- 12% of Welsh speakers stated that they would prefer to read only or mainly in Welsh. 48% of the same group responded that they would prefer to read only or mainly in English.
- 71% of the mother tongue speakers stated that their written Welsh was quite good or very good. compared with 89% of the same group who responded that their written English was quite good or very good.
- The mother tongue group's self-assessment of their speaking, listening and reading skills in Welsh was especially encouraging; on average over 86% declared themselves to be quite good or very good in this respect. However, only 71% stated their written skills to be quite good or very good.
- On average, 92% of the mother tongue group stated that their skills in English were quite good or very good.
Social domains and the use of Welsh

- The majority of Welsh speakers (80%+) used Welsh half the time or more in 10 of the 19 situations that were investigated. These 10 situations include the spheres of education, health and social services, the workplace and the library.
- Less than 60% of the same group reported that they regularly used Welsh in dealings with the Local Authority, solicitors and shops in the town.
- More than 80% of Welsh speakers would be happy to use Welsh in a cross-section of social situations if it were possible for them so to do.
- 71% of Welsh speakers claimed that the lack of opportunities to use Welsh impinged on their rights as citizens. In addition, 68% of these respondents that this lack of opportunity influenced their lack of self-confidence when using the language in public, and 70% claimed it affected their enjoyment of life.

Conclusions

2.3.1. Several of the results derived from Cwm Gwendraeth are similar to those obtained in the other study areas: they show a significant and strong support for the Welsh language, but also reveal several problems which will have to be overcome if the language planning movement is to be a complete success.

2.3.2. As in the other areas, Welsh speakers judged that their four core skills (reading, comprehension, writing and speaking) were more developed in English than they were in Welsh. Despite the complex linguistic inferiority suggested by this conclusion, the sample revealed a reliable process of inter-generational language transmission, though not without some problems due to the permanent pressure exerted by the English language.

2.3.3. Although the respondents reported that their core skills were better in English than in Welsh this appears not to have that much effect upon them - the vast majority had no problems performing a number of functions in Welsh and a significant majority (80%) reported that they would choose Welsh, or expressed no preference as to which language they used in a variety of social situations. This bodes well for the expansion of the use of Welsh in the valley and reflects the local linguistic vitality. Of course, a great concern for community language planners involved in a range of local institutions is the provision of specific opportunities for use by local
residents. The Welsh language is employed extensively within Cwm Gwendraeth, but its current use does not reflect the patterns of language preference identified by this research project. The lack of opportunity to use Welsh in Cwm Gwendraeth greatly affects the local population. Once again, the majority of Welsh speakers (71%) reported that such lack of opportunity impinging on their rights as citizens.

2.3.4. Further evidence of the strength of popular will in support of Welsh was found in the 80% + in the sample who believed that Local Authority employees who dealt with the public should speak Welsh or agree to learn it; a similar proportion supported the development of bilingual advertising in the area (84%) and a large proportion (66%) believed that companies who offered services in Welsh should be eligible for tax relief.

2.3.5. As in the other study areas, the majority of Welsh speaking respondents claimed that they would use more Welsh if additional opportunities so to do were made available, but of course, as was seen in the case of Mold such a choice has to be both visible and freely available - this was borne out in the case of bilingual telephone help-lines, where 87.1% of the sample were unaware of their existence, and not one respondent knew the relevant number.

2.3.6. The majority of the sample believed that the Welsh language should have an increased presence in Cwm Gwendraeth's community and it appears that the venture which was established for this purpose is having a positive effect on the respondents. They are almost unanimous (96%) that Menter Cwm Gwendraeth should seek to extend its activities. A majority of the sample (60%) had attended Menter sponsored functions within the year prior to the survey and there was a consensus that it served a wide range of ages.

2.3.7. In comparison with the Aman Valley, Cwm Gwendraeth's linguistic structure is more able to sustain itself. Recent developments there, such as the extension of the M4 Motorway, have facilitated daily commuting without necessitating the permanent exodus which is so harmful to the language; but, in the course of the interviewing, it became clear that this increased accessibility was also set to draw in new non-Welsh speaking residents to the district. This self-sufficiency has generated linguistic vitality together with the maturing of the process by which community leaders are formed and as a result, there is great potential for the future of Welsh in Cwm Gwendraeth, if the intervention can be both extended and deepened. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth is an influential movement in whom
the community have confidence and it has helped the residents re-gain respect for their language. It is to be hoped that there will be an expansion in their worthwhile efforts and that more constructive attitudes towards Welsh will permeate the whole of the Valley - from the leisure sector through to the private sector.

2.4. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys: The Aman Valley

Results

Household composition

- Welsh was the mother tongue for 76% of the total sample; a second language for 11.5%, while 2% had learned Welsh as adults; thus 89.5% of the sample could speak Welsh;
- 75.5% of the sample were married or had a partner
- 40% of the sample only used Welsh within the home, while a further 21% used it most often. 12% responded that they used both languages equally in the home.

It should be noted that the research revealed that the family unit was a less efficient agent of language transmission in Cwm Aman than was the case in Cwm Gwendraeth.

Linguistic skills

- 22% of the sample declared that they would prefer writing in Welsh. 54% of the sample said that they would rather write in English. 24% said that they would prefer to use both languages equally.
- 61% of Welsh speakers noted that their written Welsh was either quite good or very good compared with the 89% of the same groups who reported that their written English was either quite good or very good.
- On average over 76% of Welsh speakers claimed that their skills in Welsh comprehension, speaking and reading were quite good or very good. 61% claimed that their written Welsh was quite good or very good.
- On average 92% of Welsh speakers claimed that their English skills were quite good or very good.

Social domains and the use of Welsh

- A majority of Welsh speakers (73%) used Welsh half the time or more in the 19 social situations investigated. The social strongholds of
Welsh in Cwm Aman are in the sphere of education and the local library, but Welsh is also used extensively in the workplace, and in the delivery of particular services in the health and service sector.

- Welsh was not used as much by key personnel in the health sector such as dentists and doctors nor in dealings with local authority representatives and solicitors.
- 78% of Welsh speakers would welcome the opportunity to use Welsh more in a cross-section of normal social situations if that were possible.
- 59% of Welsh speakers were of the opinion that the lack of opportunity to use Welsh impinged on their rights as citizens. In addition, 56% of these reported that this lack of opportunity effected their self-confidence in using the language in public while 53% reported that it effected their enjoyment of life.

Conclusions

2.4.1. In the past, the Aman Valley used to be one of the traditional strongholds of Welsh in South Wales. However, by today, the nature of the community has changed a great deal and as a consequence the language faces a number of specific threats, albeit very different ones from those which are facing the language in Mold and in the Teifi Valley. These are not externally constituted, reflecting the effects of being close to the English border or the pressure of increased in-migration, rather they reflect an internal language decline which derives from the deprived social-economic situation of the community. As a result, we acknowledge that the challenge facing Menter Aman Tawe is significantly more difficult than that faced by Menter Cwm Gwendraeth, because of the main characteristics of this decline which are itemised below:

- Welsh is undergoing significant erosion in the Aman Valley as a result of the failure of inter-generational transmission of the language.
- De-industrialisation has effected the socio-linguistic situation leading to the out-migration of young people in particular from the Valley.
- There is a shortage of indigenous leaders in society.

2.4.2. At a regional level, this reflects the latest phase of the displacement process of Welsh which started in the latter half of the nineteenth century in Wales and has continued until today.

2.4.3. One can deduce the principal reason for the weakening of Welsh from considering the enormous differences between the younger age groups
and the older age groups, that is, the difference between the low proportion of mother tongue speakers in the age cohort 3-15 (29%) compared with the larger proportion in the age cohort 45-64 (77%). Similarly, the proportion of fluent speakers aged between 3-15 in the Valley is 45% but in the age group 45-64 the proportion is far higher at 73%. We know that the education system has been perceived as the chief pillar of maintaining the language as it provides opportunities to socialise young people in particular into identifying with Welsh. Today, the former mutually supportive linguistic relationship between the school and the home no longer operates as effectively as once it did. It is evident that many Welsh speaking parents in the sample use far more English than Welsh to communicate with their children as fully 71% of children aged 5-11 in the Valley do not speak Welsh at home. It is hard to believe that the other 29% who speak Welsh at home - the most fundamental domain of all - will be sufficiently strong to reproduce the Welsh culture of Cwm Aman in toto. Having said this, there are some encouraging signs, especially if consideration is given to the increasing impact of the education system.

2.4.4. The direct impact of Welsh medium education is very evident here, as it is in other areas such as the former county of Mid Glamorgan. One indicator is the rise in the proportion of five year olds who were fluent in Welsh from 16% in 1993 to 33% by January 1996. However, one should not become over-dependent on the education system in order to regenerate a rich, fully comprehensive Welsh medium community. In order that Welsh should regain its ground, especially outside the confines of the school and college classroom, there is a need for far greater social provision. It is evident that many domains are controlled by influential individuals and bilingualism is a virtue which should be advocated and strengthened, especially when one recalls that openings in so many key professions, such as doctors and solicitors, tend to attract unilingual English speakers to areas with a high proportion of Welsh speakers. In order to influence these domains, provision should be made for the effective teaching of Welsh as a second language. Thus, we recommend that a strategy for the regeneration of Welsh as a community language should bring pressure to bear on professional bodies to provide comprehensive 'in service' language training for their staff.

2.4.5. However, it is not the extension of Welsh medium training only which is required in this locale, but its incorporation within the internal administration of public bodies and in their dealings with the public. Learning and using a language are two quite different processes. In other
countries with a history of language planning, for example Canada and the Basque Country, there was often more enthusiasm among civil servants and professional workers to learn a second language, rather than to use it effectively. Thus close attention should be paid to the means by which the assiduous learning of a second language can be utilised in the workplace. Until now, the primary emphasis has been upon teaching and learning. Now a commensurate emphasis should be placed upon using Welsh and on the socialising effect of schools.

2.4.6. It is evident that the economic depression experienced in Cwm Aman has contributed to the process of weakening the potential pool of community leaders.

2.4.7. As in Cwm Gwendraeth, indicators of a strong popular will in support of Welsh are evident in the 85% of the sample who believed that all those employed by the local authority who deal with the general public should speak Welsh or agree to learn it and in the 78% who favour bilingual advertising in the area. A large proportion (65%) believed that companies should receive a reduction in their taxes so that they could provide Welsh medium services, while 73% approved of the incorporation of Welsh as an element in town and country planning considerations.

2.4.8. A majority of Welsh speakers claimed that they would use far more Welsh were additional opportunities provided so to do.

2.4.9. There was widespread support for the idea of offering language refresher courses in Cwm Aman, in order to re-energise those 'hidden or invisible Welsh speakers' who understood, but did not speak Welsh for whatever reason. Over half the sample would welcome the establishment of a Welsh-medium centre in the district.

2.4.10. We acknowledge that the emphasis on leisure activities, sports and popular culture which had characterised Menter Aman Tawe's approach to its work, has contributed to the strengthening of the community development of Welsh. But is also evident that such activities are insufficient unless they are bolstered by parallel economic intervention by other agencies, for example, the Welsh Development Agency and the local authorities.

2.5. The Main Findings of the Field Work

2.5.1. Clearly the destiny of the Welsh language depends on far more than
an increase in the numbers able to speak it. It also depends upon the vitality of the culture which is transmitted. In the Welsh speaking strongholds it is evident that the position of the Welsh language will not be restored unless it is incorporated into all aspects of life. The normalisation of Welsh will lead inevitably to its use as a natural language of choice in a number of situations, especially in relation to those normal daily tasks which are so psychologically important for increasing confidence and changing behaviour patterns. The essence of regenerating Welsh as a community language is to engender a shared responsibility for its condition among all who speak it. The field work revealed that there is a tendency among some to believe that it is official agencies only who should be actively working in favour of Welsh and in consequence, they shift the responsibility from their own hands, thereby weakening the degree of community ownership in the process of language regeneration.

2.5.2. It should be noted that the number of domains in which Welsh is used has increased significantly over the past 30 years, especially in the sphere of education, the media, leisure and selected public services. However, one should also note that there has been a corresponding intensification of the influence of the English language, particularly because of significant changes occasioned by new technology. Unless there is significant investment in the provision of an effective infra-structural support for Welsh, the ability of the individual to use Welsh will shrink within strategic domains such as the workplace and in conducting daily business life. This is not a problem which faces Welsh alone, it is characteristic of every lesser-used language.

2.5.3. By today, it is the home and the education system, rather than the community, which share the task of nurturing new speakers. It became clear from the data analysis that there was a failure to transmit the language from one generation to another in all the survey study areas. One of the reasons for this is the increase in the numbers of Welsh speakers who choose a non-Welsh speaking partner. One cannot assume that Welsh would be the main family language; indeed, there is considerable evidence to suggest that English would be the language of the home. Notwithstanding this, one cannot attribute the failure to transmit the language to the home environment alone, rather it is reflective of wider social changes. One of the obvious changes is the decline in the appeal of the traditional social networks which used to support Welsh outside the home and the school. In addition one should note the relative decline in the number of normal opportunities afforded to children and young people to mix with each other.
and with a wide range of adults, quite apart from their immediate family members. This reflects the social fragmentation which has been evident since the sixties. This is the principal challenge which has to be met if we wish to secure the future of Welsh within our communities.

2.5.4 One means of achieving this is to adopt an idea found in some countries whereby activities are arranged whereby the older generation speak the lesser used language to the young people of the area in social centres, thereby hoping to incorporate the youngsters into the language community. In time, it is hoped that the parents of such children, i.e. the semi-speakers to whom reference is made often in the full report, would also re-possess the language. This is the real meaning of a community language, as many assert, "we should not be speaking about the language but rather speaking in the language on every possible occasion." Currently, there is a danger that by over-emphasising and over-defining the target groups according to their age structures we lose the opportunity to attract all to share the Welsh language in a full community context.

2.5.5. There was considerable evidence that the public reacted favourably to opportunities to use Welsh in situations where the choice offered to them was both clear and convenient. For example, the frequency of choosing Welsh whilst using the bank and building societies' automatic cash dispensing machines was relatively high because one is specifically prompted to select a language of transaction. Where no such clear choice is offered, and in circumstances where the customer has to search for a Welsh-medium provision (as is the case with BT Welsh medium help-lines), the various opportunities available are under utilised. Offering a choice of language is therefore critical to an increased use of Welsh.

2.5.6. It was found that people were not generally accustomed to using the language, and to some extent this derived from a lack of opportunity or an unwillingness on behalf of the individual to choose to use Welsh. Several factors influence this tendency. Often it was an awkward experience in using or in asking for a Welsh-medium service which was responsible for conditioning many to opt for the English rather than the Welsh medium provision. Another factor is the perception held by many of the respondents that their linguistic skills were deficient, especially within formal situations. Cumulatively these add to a lack of confidence among all age groups in opting to use Welsh rather than English, even in those newer social domains where by today the choice of language exists.

2.5.7. In general the respondents all ranked their core language skills
(understanding, speaking, reading and writing) slightly higher in English than in Welsh. We attribute this to a lack of use of the language, the reaction by some to their experience within the education system, a lack of bilingual provision within the community and the cumulative impact of English on Welsh society generally. Several of the respondents noted feelings of inferiority as regards their Welsh linguistic abilities, especially in comparison with the perceived 'standard Welsh' as used by the media.

2.5.8. There was a great deal of concern surrounding the deleterious effects of unilingual English speakers migrating into predominantly Welsh speaking communities, and of the influence of key individuals such as doctors, ministers of religion, health visitors and managers, on the patterns of Welsh used in the community. In addition, there was a call for a reconsideration of the statutory planning process to protect the role of Welsh within the community.

2.5.9. In those domains where there has been considerable investment in the past, for example, in the area of education, and to a lesser extent within public sector provision, there is a readiness and desire to take up the opportunities to use the language. Our principal finding is that the general public is favourably disposed to extending bilingualism in the community. There is no doubting the genuine support for Welsh and we believe that this is a growing tendency. But, in order to realise language rights through offering a choice of service, there has to be much more effective provision. Conventionally the emphasis was placed on increasing the numbers able to speak Welsh, and this continues to be of prime importance. But in addition to this, it is time that we adopted effective bilingual working practices which are attractive to the public. Unless this is done, the recent enthusiasm displayed recently over the improved status of Welsh is self-deception. The most promising situations where the use of Welsh could be increased are set out in the full report.

2.5.10. On the whole, the public displayed particularly favourable attitudes to increasing bilingual provision in the following spheres:

- in the advertising world;
- in incorporating the interests of Welsh within the town and country planning system;
- in promoting Welsh within the business environment;
- in the workplace generally.

2.5.11. Second language speakers did not always feel themselves to be part
of the available Welsh language networks. Some who were learning the language reported that they found difficulty being accepted by fluent speakers, and as such felt that they were being excluded from the Welsh speaking community.

2.5.12. There is a significant potential for the increased use of Welsh; and this was welcomed by the overwhelming majority of the sample. Similarly, there is also a high potential to increase the new opportunities to use the language. However, it should be acknowledged that there is a discrepancy at present between the explicit aspirations of the respondents to use more Welsh and their daily practical choices. It appears that there would be an increased employment of the language - across the whole range of language abilities - if greater provision were made for its use, and were this to be done new speakers could be drawn into the language network.

2.5.13. To date the potential of Welsh in the business sector has not been realised. Evidence from the field work confirms that the lack of provision for Welsh militates against its use, especially in office work and in dealings with the public sector.

2.5.14. It is therefore evident that a number of factors influence the degree to which Welsh is used by the respondents in the study areas, though one should note, of course, that not all the communities face the same problems. Nevertheless, consideration should be given to the extent to which it is desirable to attempt to influence such factors so as to bring about a change in the patterns of language use by intervening in the normal social processes of the community. In the next section of the report consideration is given to linguistic intervention strategies by evaluating the experience of such intervention in the Teifi Valley and in the Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys. The effects of not intervening in the linguistic situation and allowing the normalisation processes to progress unhindered - the situation in Mold - are also discussed.

3. Linguistic Intervention: Effective Intervention?

3.1. Mold and district

3.1.1. Mold represents a fairly common situation in Wales for only some
20% here speak Welsh. Nevertheless, the area is also significant because of its proximity to the English border, and as a result it shares many of the economic and social structural characteristics of Chester, Liverpool and north-west England. This geographical context shapes many of the local attitudes and possibilities, including considerations of what is constituted by the phrase "a Welsh way of life".

3.1.2. On the one hand, because of its status as the administrative centre of the former county of Clwyd, there are a considerable number of professional workers in the Mold area, particularly teachers and public sector employees. The growth of formal Welsh-medium education has been a success here, but one hears the same old story, i.e. that there is a lack of opportunity to use the language outside school. Consequently there is a need to develop additional opportunities so as to influence patterns of language choice, particularly in those domains which appeal to young people.

3.1.3. On the other hand, English culture is most prominent among the working class of Mold and the Dee Estuary generally, and in consequence, it is English which is used primarily in sporting, leisure, and shopping activities and in dealings with the 'establishment', and that for a number of reasons:

- because of their position as a minority many Welsh speakers are very passive;
- considering that the population is so mixed it is hard to identify who belongs to which network and social grouping for there are so many "invisible Welsh speakers", defined as those who do not form part of current Welsh networks;
- by and large the area is characterised by very traditional Welsh networks and activities e.g.
- dramas, evening classes, dinner clubs, Cerdd Dant festivals.

3.1.4. At one level, Welsh has maintained its position in Mold and district in a rather remarkable way considering the centuries of English influence and its proximity to the border with England. The language's position was reinforced by a fairly consistent inflow from solid Welsh speaking communities throughout North Wales. Thus the networks which are available to Welsh speakers are both numerous and well-established. However, such networks neither succeed in attracting the whole gamut of Welsh speakers nor the overwhelming majority of non-Welsh speakers. The local Welsh medium schools have produced thousands of new Welsh
speakers, but their full potential has not been realised because the opportunity to use Welsh outside the school classroom has not evolved to the same extent as has the bilingual educational system itself. The considerable growth in the numbers able to speak the language might have lead to the formation of many new networks in the region; however, to a large extent this has not happened and is unlikely to happen until a comprehensive assessment of the potential of Welsh in the region is undertaken with subsequent enactment of language intervention measures. It is thus fair to ask whether we have been unduly satisfied by the increase in the number of Welsh speaking pupils, without giving due consideration to the wider social implications. It goes without saying that the failure to realise the full potential of Welsh in Mold and district and the associated over-emphasis on the bilingual education system is equally true of many other regions in Wales.

3.1.5. We believe that we could be on the verge of a new period in society's use of Welsh. The national developments in the status of the language and its increased use in a wider range of social domains than ever before is bound to impact on the positions of Welsh speakers in Mold as individuals. But in order to secure the relevance of Welsh as an active community language, it is essential that we invest in a local infra-structure which will maintain Welsh in an effective manner. The situation in Mold and district is the obverse of that which normally characterises traditional industrial regions, for example, Cwm Aman. Mold has a plethora of social and community leaders, be they teachers, lecturers, civil servants, ministers of religion and so on. Unfortunately, the networks which they sustain do not seem to appeal either to the young or to the "invisible Welsh speakers".

3.1.6. Unless there is linguistic intervention the status quo will remain and Welsh will not reach its full potential. Without some sort of intervention or additional activity, especially among the young, there will be in Mold a tendency to be satisfied by the transmission of the language only, and not the reproduction of the whole culture in its totality. It would therefore be unfair to expect the education system to adopt the role of "saviour of the language" without significant additional support from the whole community.

3.1.7. The potential for establishing some sort of body to promote Welsh is relatively high here. Such an institution could satisfy the need to create opportunities for socialising, especially among the young. The data indicates that there would be a warm welcome in Mold for the
establishment of an institution dedicated to the re-energising of Welsh at the local community level, and to satisfy the changes that legislation and public opinion have gradually set in train at the wider level. Among other things, such an institution would provide a big fillip to bilingualism, be a good way of harnessing the potential we discussed earlier, and - if it were administered sensitively - be a bridge between the different language factions whether or not they be native or in-migrant in origin.

3.1.8. Such an institution should arrange activities which would attract the whole cross-section of the population to the Welsh speaking community in order to erode ignorance and socio-linguistic suspicion. It is, after all, the non-Welsh speaking majority who influence, and will continue to influence, both the patterns of language use in the community and the formulation of local policy for they will constitute:

- the likely partners of Welsh speakers;
- the majority of current and future parents;
- future customers and co-workers within the bilingual services;
- current and future voters, taxpayers and citizens.

3.1.9. Practical measures for linguistic intervention in Mold and similar areas in Wales are discussed later on in this Summary Report.

3.2. Teifi Valley

3.2.1. In the case of the Teifi Valley economic intervention has been the predominant form of intervention hitherto, although linguistic and community concerns were among the initial motivating factors. Antur Teifi was established in 1980 with the express aim of re-creating sustainable employment opportunities in the Teifi Valley. The Antur's strength comes from the dedication of committed individuals drawn from the local community. They understand well the nature of the socio-economic changes which have impacted on the Valley, and have attempted to provide answers which are appropriate to local problems, primarily through economic initiatives rather than through purely linguistic methods.

3.2.2. It is clear that the various responsibilities discharged by Antur Teifi are based upon economic development and occupational training, especially in relation to agricultural diversification and telematics.

3.2.3. The interventionist process succeeds by:
- regenerating the local infra-structure;
- advising on and promoting development;
- co-operating with other bodies;
- being enterprising - through the provision of services and products to be utilised by others.

3.2.4. The Welsh language is an integral part of their activities, with 90% of the staff able to speak Welsh. The added value which has been derived from its establishment includes:

- effective networking;
- support from agencies such as the Development Board for Rural Wales, the Welsh Development Agency and the Leader Project.
- a willingness to respond to local social and training needs;
- a commitment to contribute to community welfare;
- flexibility in reacting to local, national and international economic fluctuations;
- a pragmatic and sophisticated work culture;
- the provision of opportunities so as to allow young people to remain in the area.

3.2.5. There was considerable agreement within the sample that Welsh should increase in the area and associated with this one could say that there would be a warm welcome for any specific action which sought to promote the language there. A large proportion of the respondents indicated that they would be in favour of Antur Teifi extending its remit so as to promote Welsh in the community (76.4% of those who expressed an opinion). Given its current remit, the Antur conjured up a fairly robust image in the minds of the respondents, only a small minority (8.7%) believed the Antur to be beyond the needs of the local population, while many more were of the opinion that it should either constitute a training programme for local entrepreneurs or become the co-ordinating body responsible for the promotion of the Welsh language in the community.

3.2.6. It is evident that Antur Teifi has made a significant contribution to mitigate the effects of economic decline in the area, and in so doing has succeeded in presenting a modern image for Welsh as a language of business and has extended its remit in practical terms. To date the social and purely linguistic aspects of Antur Teifi's activities have not been developed, but the potential for such extension is very high, either as an element of Antur Teifi's mission or through that of another agency. The considerable agreement which exists that Welsh should increase in the area
is reflected in the number of respondents who believed that Antur Teifi should extend its remit so as to promote the interests of Welsh in the community (76.4% of those who expressed an opinion).

3.2.7. Antur Teifi is a very good example of a locally grounded community venture, and as such is more likely to succeed because it is well placed to respond to the needs of a local economy in a state of flux. There is no tension between its ideology and praxis. Consequently Antur Teifi contributes significantly to the area's development in a sustainable manner, and thereby serves a different mix of needs than do the Mentrau Iaith which are discussed below. As a result of our investigation into the contribution of Antur Teifi to the relative success of the Welsh rural economy, we are convinced that this form of interventionist agency should be adopted in other areas for it contributes to sustainable development without weakening the linguistic integrity of the community.

3.3. Gwendraeth and Aman Valleys

3.3.1. These were the first areas to experience the effect of specific initiatives in status language planning. They are the strongest Welsh speaking areas within industrial Wales, and as a consequence the local networks and language behaviour patterns reflect the vicissitudes of Welsh within an increasingly anglicised urban context.

3.3.2. As a result of these fundamental changes, it was recognised that the position of Welsh as the predominant community language was under threat. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth was established in January 1991 as a pioneering programme to promote Welsh at the community level and as an attempt to restore the primacy of Welsh. One of the initial prime considerations was that it should also provide a model for language planning in action and devise best practice examples which could be adapted to other parts of Wales. Menter Aman Tawe was established in January 1994.

3.3.3. It is quite evident that there is a widespread appreciation among the general population of the activities of the Mentrau Iaith for they have both enriched the quality of life and had a positive reinforcing effect on respondents' attitudes to Welsh and their use thereof. There are fundamental differences between the two Mentrau Iaith. Given this, the opportunity was taken to compare and contrast their relative success in the regeneration of Welsh.
3.4. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth

3.4.1. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth's strategy is predicated on the following general goals and aims:

- to create social conditions that will nurture positive attitudes towards Welsh and an increase in its general use;
- to normalise the use of Welsh as a medium of social and institutional communication;
- to highlight the close relationship between language and attitudes which relate to quality of life issues, the environment and the local economy.

3.4.2. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth has benefited from attracting very able key personnel who have shown great acumen in developing an objective strategic development plan. This includes the setting of realistic targets, analysing specific issues relevant to the Menter by using a variety of primary and secondary data, detailed monitoring of its projects, and critical self-assessment of its practical activities in the field of language planning. In this respect, the Menter represents a pioneering model of sound purposive planning.

3.4.3. In order to avoid the danger of overly-centralised planning, the Menter established a series of local village committees to share ownership in the processes of language intervention. These committees offer an opportunity to integrate the local community into the decision-making process and in implementing the Menter's policy. This has been rewarded in terms of the community's support and good will - the sample greatly appreciated the existence of Menter Cwm Gwendraeth - and also in terms of restoring the community's confidence in using the language in public.

3.4.4. The Menter has demonstrated its readiness to create working partnerships with other bodies and agencies. It has extended its influence such that it is perceived as a community development enterprise which emphasises the Welsh language and which uses it to accomplish its tasks. This is how a Menter should be seen in such a socio-linguistic environment, where the language is a means to achieving social ends rather than an end in an in itself. In its development as a community agency, the Menter has succeeded in attracting financial support form new sources, including a substantial grant from the European Union.

3.5. Menter Aman Tawe
3.5.1. The goals of the Menter may be expressed in the following manner:

- a programme to promote the Welsh language in the Tawe and Aman Valleys;
- a programme to secure an appropriate place for Welsh in both valleys;
- a programme to stimulate enthusiasm and pride in our heritage.

3.5.2. The Tawe valley was not included as part of the field work. The research focus in this area was the western part of the Menter Aman Tawe region, namely the Aman Valley, where the linguistic characteristics and networks of the community were investigated.

3.5.3. Menter Aman Tawe functions as a co-ordinating forum for Welsh in a relatively depressed region. It consciously focuses on youth work and on adopting Welsh as a natural extension of daily life, including social activities, games and cultural events. One of the great virtues revealed by the field work was that those who took part in activities organised by the Menter very much enjoyed them; there is no feeling that such activities are attended out of a sense of duty, rather that they are core community youth functions. It should be noted however, that the continued effectiveness of such activities organised by the Menter are dependent upon a relatively small group of volunteers.

3.5.4. Compared with Menter Cwm Gwendraeth, Menter Aman Tawe places a greater emphasis on direct social involvement with people and pays far less attention to structural planning. Some might argue that Menter Aman Tawe's impact is thus more immediate and direct, adopting an essentially pragmatic mode of action. However, this style also reflects the social structure of the area. Initially some 25 village committees were established to expedite the work of the Menter. By now many of these have ceased to function due to a lack of sustained enthusiasm.

3.5.5. The main challenge which faces Menter Aman Tawe is the lack of social leaders who can advance its cause. There is no lack of commitment or initiative displayed by its staff - what is lacking is a sense of community ownership of the Menter, as opposed to a community interest in its success. Thus, it is recommended that greater attention be paid to the manner in which social leaders are nurtured and integrated into the language regeneration process. There is a dire need for a framework whereby local community leaders can be trained. This could be incorporated as part of the Menter Iaith's remit together with its partners in the community so as to ensure effective linguistic networks. Unless this is achieved, the language
frontier will spread ineluctably further west. In its current format, Menter Aman Tawe's long-term potential for self-sustaining development is moderate to slight.

3.6. Conclusion

3.6.1. The principal consequence of linguistic intervention in the two valleys was an upsurge in community confidence and pride as they saw exciting things happen in the area. It has also contributed to the re-establishment of cultural and socio-economic networks. In addition to organising new opportunities for people to use the language, the existence of the Mentrau Iaith has prompted many of the region's institutions to ensure that a practical language choice was on offer, and through this, facilitate the use of Welsh in new domains, especially in Cwm Gwendraeth. In the long term these new networks should support a wide range of Welsh medium activities because the general public perceives that the language has a permanent worth. The research indicates that Welsh is gradually regaining some of its lost ground in several spheres of activity, but especially in the following:

- the language of popular culture in the area e.g. rugby, cricket, drama;
- the health services and community care provision;
- children's chosen language of play outside the confines of school;
- working men's clubs and public houses.

3.6.2. Despite this, the future is still uncertain because the process of normalisation depends to a great extent on the ready support of the community.

3.6.3. The Mentrau Iaith experience of language intervention has thus had a direct impact on the situation of Welsh in these areas and it is evident that there is a great appreciation of their contribution to the improvement of the quality of life in Cwm Gwendraeth and Cwm Aman. The research findings clearly justify the conclusion that these are instruments which can be refined and adapted so as to meet the needs of declining linguistic communities in other locales, including those factors which were mentioned in section 2 of this report. We recommend that this should be done. Clearly one should not overgeneralise from the experience of those Mentrau hitherto established and seek to construct an all-inclusive model which would represent the ideal Menter Iaith. The virtue of the Menter Iaith concept is the fact that it is neither dependent on adopting one style of implementation, nor predicated upon a particular structure. The flexibility
to react in an effective and purposeful manner to local needs is a core strength. The Menter Iaith as a concept is a firm foundation capable of further development, upon which one could construct a local language planning framework.

3.6.4. The next section includes further considerations of this.


4.1. The Welsh Speaking Community?

4.1.1. The condition of the Welsh speaking community has been a source of great concern for many for some time. However, the whole concept of a 'community' can be problematic if it is restricted only to traditional activities and by so doing the contemporary reality of Wales is ignored. Often it is a very partial view of the Welsh speaking community which is presented, stripped of its inherent pluralism. In order to ensure effective language intervention from the beginning, any intervention agency must seek to understand the true nature of the community as it is, and seek to operate in a manner which is relevant to that specific community, rather than presume that it is possible to reconstruct a community structure which is no longer practicable. By definition both the nature of society and the nature of community are changing apace. It goes without saying that change per se is not necessarily a threat to Welsh.

4.1.2. It is obvious that the apparent effectiveness of any Menter Iaith is to some extent predicated upon the initial situation of the language in the community and on the determination of some community members 'to do something about it'. Indeed one could argue that it would be most difficult developing a Menter Iaith in an area where such desires were not abundantly clear; thus it would be unwise to rush to establish a Menter unless there were local support for such linguistic intervention. Regenerating Welsh in the community is a long-term process. It would be naïve to assume that any interventionist agency could directly influence the lives of the majority of any area's residents in the short term, especially if it were externally initiated. One would not expect any social agency to influence the majority of people the majority of the time. Similarly, one
would not expect different communities to react in a uniform manner to the same regenerative stimuli. The flexibility to react effectively to a particular area's specific needs is an integral element to the concept of a Menter Iaith

4.2. Mentrau Iaith to strengthen Welsh

4.2.1. It is a little premature to assess the full impact of the Mentrau Iaith in seeking to regenerate the Welsh language in their respective areas, but one should not underestimate their potential. To date, this is the most effective means of initiating and maintaining a regenerative strategy at the local level. Mentrau are likely to become the key instruments for stabilising linguistic fragmentation, especially in areas where there is a high proportion of Welsh speakers. Without such a framework, it is hard to envisage how the Welsh Language Board's Strategy, which was published in December 1996, will be realised. It is anticipated that in the future the existence of a number of Mentrau Iaith of various types will lead to the establishment of a data base of good practice which will enrich our experience of language planning. It is hoped thereby that one may formulate more dependable methods of anticipating the results of language intervention measures.

4.2.2. There are two principal reasons for supporting and encouraging the establishment of Mentrau Iaith:

- In situations which are characterised by strong language potential but have weak socio-linguistic networks, they offer a significant socio-psychological fillip for maintaining the Welsh language in contexts which would otherwise lead to fragmentation;
- In respect of their remit as local language planning bodies, they can function as a focus to create a new set of partnerships between the central government (in the form of the Welsh Office), the Welsh Language Board, local government, statutory public bodies, health trusts and a variety of other voluntary agencies and private companies, so as to extend the opportunities to use Welsh.

4.2.3. Mentrau have a significant advantage in that they can shape a new role for Welsh in hitherto limited domains, and that outside the confines of the official administration of any district. This autonomy enables the Mentrau to initiate novel and pioneering forms of encouraging the use of Welsh, and to take advantage of successive opportunities as they arise. However, in order to maximise this autonomy Mentrau have to display a considerable degree of political acumen and inter-personal skills. As such, they may operate and be perceived as highly respected co-ordinating
bodies, without necessarily accruing any political status or power. As currently constituted, Mentrau Iaith will continue to depend on other more established agencies both for their existence and for their shared success. However, as they seek to extend their remit and co-operate with others within the system so as to improve the communities they serve, they will have to be wary of being assimilated and of losing sight of their original linguistic focus.

4.2.4. The great strength of Mentrau Iaith is that they seek to serve the needs of the local community. It is evident that from their very foundation, all Mentrau Iaith should adopt a series of goals, aims and specific relevant responsibilities. However, as so much of the rationale of the Mentrau is dependent upon the particular circumstances surrounding their establishment, together with their key personnel, it would be unwise to set forth a prescriptive list of goals, aims and responsibilities to satisfy all possible eventualities; particularly on the basis of such a restricted sample as obtains in this research project. One of the aims of this current research is to suggest a reasonable framework through which the concept of Mentrau Iaith may be developed, thus we set out below a list of the relevant factors to be taken into considerations when establishing a new Menter Iaith. Many questions are raised in determining such a framework.

4.2.5. The first question is whether or not one should promote the establishment of a language enterprise or a community enterprise? In considering Mentrau Iaith, is it inevitable that they necessarily be temporary creations? If a Menter is to be a pioneering, interventionist agency which is meant to change expectations, create new networks and enable communities to regain ground which they have lost in linguistic terms, does it follow that any Language Enterprise should be a short-term or a medium-term agency? In similar vein, does it follow that other agencies which seek to improve the situation of Welsh through improving the socio-linguistic nature of the community should become permanent entities? Should such entities be primarily community enterprises or economic enterprises or a combination of both? Or should we be developing a model which is closer to that of an agency charged with the co-ordination and encouragement of Welsh medium activities initiated by others?

4.2.6. It is good that the Welsh Language Board is seen as the body which facilitates and provides initial financial support for new local ventures, such as Menter Cwm Gwendraeth and Menter Aman Tawe. Without such
external stimuli and financial backing it is highly unlikely that the Mentr
Iaith would have developed to the same extent. However, it is also unlikely
that the Welsh Language Board will be able to assist new Mentr to the
same financial extent as they have assisted the already established Mentr,
so Mentr will have to seek additional sources of financial support.
Specifically, we presume that local authorities will have to take more
responsibility for supporting the needs of new Mentr Iaith. In political
terms this is a positive move, and is far more likely to enable Mentr Iaith
to co-ordinate their myriad activities within the variety of well-established
statutory and voluntary activities. It is essential that Mentr Iaith in the
future be perceived as worthwhile, cost-effective interventionist agencies
engaged in the process of community regeneration.

4.2.7. It could be argued that one of the key goals of status language
planning should be to enable the language to be more self-sufficient by
raising the general public's awareness of the potential for using Welsh as a
community language. Naturally it follows that one of the prime aims of any
Menter Iaith should be to encourage and facilitate the community to
appropriate the language including transferring responsibility for its
continued survival back to community volunteers. By definition the
question as to how long it might take to achieve this so that the community
is willing to shoulder the responsibility - and to what extent the dissolution
of the Menter as a result of this will cause harm to the language - is difficult
to answer and will vary according to each situation.

4.2.8. Of course, the reality of the situation is the tendency for the catalytic
element to become established - that is, there is a tendency for bodies to
justify their existence by becoming part of the very system they were
designed to effect through intervention. As any Menter Iaith is, in essence,
a temporary creation, it is fair to ask how this tendency may be overcome.
A section of the main report addresses several questions pertaining to this
tension between, on the one hand, the tendency for Mentr to become
established agencies and on the other hand, the need to return ownership to
the community.

4.2.9. We acknowledge that there are few standard answers to these
questions. It is evident that answers which satisfy the circumstances of one
community will not be appropriate for those of other communities. Even so,
we recognise an urgent need to develop a framework which will provide
guidance to those who wish to establish a Menter, and we believe that such
a framework should seek to combine the activities of the Mentr Iaith
together with those of more established core bodies such as departments of education, health and welfare etc. It should be recalled that the essential task of a Menter Iaith is to persuade others to act; it is not the function of a Menter to take unto itself the responsibility for all activities.

4.3 The Framework

4.3.1. In the long run the prime aim of the Mentrau Iaith is to normalise the use of the Welsh language. Menter Cwm Gwendraeth has recognised this and we consider that the general aims of its Strategy are appropriate for all Mentrau Iaith:

- to create social conditions that will nurture positive attitudes towards Welsh and an increase in its use;
- to normalise the use of Welsh as a medium of social and institutional communication;
- to highlight the close relationship between language and attitudes which relate to quality of life issues, the environment and the local economy.

4.3.2. In addition, on the basis of our research investigations, widespread consultation and a consideration of the implications of developing the Menter Iaith concept, we recommend that the aims of each Menter should include the following additional elements:

- to encourage and facilitate community ownership of the language, together with transferring responsibility for it back to volunteers and the Menter's community partners;
- by means of social and leisure activities, to increase the opportunities available for people to use Welsh;
- to work for the promotion of Welsh in the community through co-operation with movements, institutional representatives and other individuals at local and national level;
- to raise the profile of Welsh in business in the local area;
- to promote bilingualism in the workplace;
- to encourage Welsh speakers to use the language and to make use of existing bilingual opportunities;
- to improve the command of the language of fluent speakers;
- to regain speakers who lack confidence in their competency in the language, or those who have lost their Welsh for whatever reason;
- to offer practical assistance to adult learners and pupils who are learning Welsh as a second language;
• to assimilate new speakers to the Welsh-speaking community and to inform the first-language speakers about their needs;
• to lobby training agencies to prepare professional bilingual and language-friendly materials;
• to disseminate information about local Welsh-medium education and training;
• if appropriate, to promote issues which will lead to local economic development.

4.3.3. In addition, itemised below are some administrative issues which should be considered when planning and launching a new Menter Iaith:

• an appropriate management structure for each new situation;
• a robust financial plan for the likely life-span of the Menter (initially some 2-5 years would be appropriate);
• practical suggestions as to how to 'normalise' the Mentrau Iaith so that they gradually lessen their dependence upon government direct grant as they seek to become self-sustaining agencies, genuinely working within the community they serve and from which they arose;
• detailed consideration of the target area's networks together with a consideration of the socio-linguistic nature and wishes of those which might be described as "the invisible Welsh speakers" i.e. those citizens who currently do not constitute an element of the existing Welsh-medium networks
• consideration of the role and possible harmful effects of new forms of telecommunications in maintaining newer networks;
• consideration of the benefits that would accrue following the establishment of cultural resource centres, not necessarily as an integral part of the Mentrau: they could be formed as an additional initiative in the light of the Menter's success, in which case the element of co-operation in any proposed relationship should be stressed;
• consideration should be given to convening a series of seminars in association with the agencies, the local authorities and disciplinary specialists in this area of work in order to discuss and evaluate the experience gained hitherto;
• preparation of an information pack which would review the concept of community planning; and provide an outline of the strategies and efficacy of the current Mentrau; offer examples of successful and unsuccessful features together with a detailed interpretative account; an outline of the probable annual investment so that all decisions are made upon a realistic basis.
4.3.4. Of course, all of these elements depend upon a clear definition of the role of the Welsh Language Board in the process of stimulating practical developments in the field of language planning in Wales. A clear understanding is needed of the formal agreement between the Welsh Language Board and the Mentrau Iaith, which specifies the nature of the relationship and an outline of the responsibilities shared with others who provide bilingual services. Unless a good working relationship is established between the Welsh Language Board and embryonic Mentrau Iaith, there is a great danger for everyone to operate independently and for the Language Board to miss the opportunity to steer developments in a strategic manner. This does not necessarily imply financial considerations in each case, but rather specialist inputs and political direction. The Board's initial focus on patterns of language behaviour and Mentrau Iaith is reasonable, but additional work needs to be developed on a number of other factors which influence the transmission and use of Welsh, such as:

- vocational structures and local economic development;
- non-traditional social networks, especially in urban contexts;
- research on the social and economic implications of telematic networks;
- demographic trends and age/sex differences by language acquisition and maintenance;
- a lucid understanding of rural community changes which may be independent of, though contributing to, those conditions which maintain Welsh as a dynamic element in society;
- an analysis of the contemporary Welsh way of life;
- consideration of the methods to strengthen the linguistic abilities of Welsh speakers;
- research on how the Mentrau may evolve as agents in the field of social development.

4.3.5. Reference is made to some of these elements and factors in our principal recommendations which appear at the end of this document.

5. Other methods of intervention

5.0.1. No matter how significant and popular may be the concept of a Menter Iaith, it should be recognised that it is not the sole method of
Intervening in the fortunes of Welsh. In addition to the need to intervene at the level of the local community, the results of this research demonstrate the need to pay attention to broader issues. In the next section we give consideration to other methods of intervention at a variety of levels so as to meet the needs itemised in section 2 of this Summary Report; particular attention is given to:

- Mentrau to promote Welsh as the county level
- Resource Centres
- Language Animateurs.

5.0.2. It should be noted from the outset that these methods of intervention are not considered to be alternatives to the Mentrau Iaith; rather, if adopted in tandem, they can offer a complementary infra-structure so as to facilitate the language planning activities at the local community level.

5.1. Language initiatives at the county level: the case of Carmarthenshire

5.1.1. In 1996 Carmarthenshire County Council established a Consultative Panel on Language Planning to develop the idea of establishing a county wide language planning framework. The variety of ways in which current provision could be developed and enhanced was summarised by the Consultative Panel - which included representatives of the Mentrau Iaith, the Welsh Language Board and the University of Wales, Cardiff - as a choice between the following options or a combination of them:

- establish additional Mentrau throughout the County.
- establish a County level language initiative with a number of satellites throughout the County.
- develop the current Mentrau and Anturiaethau (Initiatives and Enterprises) together with a forum to co-ordinate their activities.

5.1.2. We believe that here is a firm foundation for the development of an effective county action framework, within the context of the County Language Plan. This could also become a model blueprint for other counties in Wales.

5.1.3. The developments in Carmarthenshire are important for the whole of Wales. Within the context of developing policies which will secure the health and survival of the language in the County, this pioneering model is a 'test case' of how to initiate successful language intervention. Clearly the
development of language planning is a new phenomenon in comparison with many other spheres which have experienced significant developments, such as, the development of bilingual education or the media. Until relatively recently, the role of the community in maintaining the language was neglected, even though it is within the community that one sees the real potential for regenerating the Welsh language.

5.1.4. It is obvious that the County Council's structure and language plan are critically important for the institutionalisation of Welsh within the administrative system. It follows that the character and manner in which the County performs its duties impacts upon the expectations of its staff, the general public and councillors. The County Council is familiar with the disparate nature of its communities and often it has responsibility for functions such as town and country planning, several public services and the like. It also influences the appointment of personnel to direct leisure centres and training centres etc. We are conscious that we are describing a process, however, connecting the proposed County Initiative to County Council systems of administration framework would enable them to benefit from the experience, specialist knowledge, purchasing power and forward planning of a number of agencies which deal directly with the County Council. In turn they may assist local authorities to implement their language plans and offer practical experience when it comes to revising the language policies of the unitary authorities. Carmarthenshire, as a committed local authority, is likely to have national influence on the process of language planning, particularly as regards other public bodies, and of course, political parties and socio-economic agencies.

5.1.5. A firm and flexible county framework would also enable any new County Initiatives to benefit both from the good and bad experiences of the current Menter, as well as creating new ways of working effectively. In addition, the development of a county-wide language planning framework could strengthen the role of current and proposed Menterau, by co-ordinating their work and providing cultural and political networks which could be mobilised to bring pressure on agencies as and when required.

5.1.6. Another advantage would be the possibility of enabling experienced individuals from one Menter to participate in projects initiated by external agencies and other Menterau e.g. selective work with special needs children, development work with new bodies or new ways of utilising telecommunication facilities to teach through the medium of Welsh, to diffuse information and to network effectively.
5.1.7. Resource information packs could also be prepared jointly in association with county or national level organisations, drawing on the specialist staff experience of the Mentrau and the Resource Centres described below.

5.1.8. It is acknowledged that some local authorities will interpret such developments as a means of transferring the financial cost of supporting Mentrau Iaith from the Welsh Language Board to local authorities themselves in straitened financial circumstances. But this reflects the reality of the current climate of public spending constraint.

5.1.9. The fact that some of the new Mentrau will be serving widely dispersed rural populations suggests that their character will be quite different from those which currently operate in Cwm Gwendraeth and Aman Tawe. The chief task of the new Mentrau would be to raise the profile of Welsh and co-ordinate current activities so that the language will prosper. There is little value in establishing a new Menter unless it supports new activities, where both intervention and maintenance are both important aspects. In order to justify the cost of the investment, careful consideration of the remit of the proposed Menter and the linguistic character of the area it will serve should be undertaken in comparison with existing Mentrau before initiating any interventionist action. The implication of this is to create a greater dependence initially on organisations such as the Resource Centres described below. Indeed, we anticipate that the concepts of County Language Initiatives and County Language Resource Centres will be developed in tandem.

5.2. County Language Resource Centres.

5.2.1. The Language Resource Centre would be the principal instrument for developing the County Authority's language plans and in realising the potential for increasing the Welshness of the county's civic culture through the lead given by local authorities. Similarly, the centre would be the county's principal agency for promoting its statutory language processes, the process of improving the county's bilingual service and in securing the provision of adequate resources and appropriate materials.

5.2.2. In respect of the statutory language processes, the Language Resource Centre would have the relevant linguistic specialism for all aspects of the county's responsibilities. Specifically it would:

- offer professional advice to councillors, the officers of public, private
and voluntary organisations and all residents of the county;
• arrange seminars and training for county officers and the staff of Mentrau;
• co-ordinate the relevant parts of the county's operational plans so as to improve its internal organisation, encourage communications in Welsh, provide advice on bilingual interaction with the public, offer professional language-related advice on publications, forms, public signs, leaflets for contracted services and various other county activities.

5.2.3. The Centre's prime responsibility would be to improve the bilingual service provided to the general public. It would achieve this through co-operating effectively with other County Council departments e.g. by issuing specific advice on socio-linguistic targets to School Governors, to the Department of Community Affairs, the Probation Service, the Rent Office, the Careers Service, focusing on specific issues in turn.

5.2.4. Such Centres would also have to conduct language skills audits of those who provide particular services on behalf of the County whether or not they are directly employed by it. This includes a language audit; an analysis of the linguistic requirements of specific posts; identifying the levels of written competence required; identifying what type of support both learners and bilingual officers would need. The aim would be to allow for a genuine choice of language of work and social interaction to be exercised in the County, thereby increasing the Welsh-medium character of the County's civic culture.

5.2.5. The Centres could also function as contact points or providers of essential materials and resources such as instantaneous translation equipment, videos, Welsh origin, Welsh-medium and bilingual software. There is also the additional possibility of sharing resources with the Education Authority and other departments of the County Council e.g. the libraries, the marketing sections, the town and country planning departments etc. It follows that materials and resources prepared by the Welsh Language Board, the County Mentrau and other centres would be critical in strengthening the services provided by any particular county.

5.2.6. Also it is possible to develop the peripatetic and mobile services e.g. the Welsh-medium occupational training services; the translation services; Welsh-medium children's play buses which also host intensive Welsh lessons for parents. One obvious need in many communities which the Resource Centre could meet is the provision of fully equipped
5.3. A National Language Resource Centre

5.3.1. It is evident that the Welsh Language Board's Strategy has to be interpreted at a number of levels and expanding the role of the Mentrau Iaith is an integral part of it. It is increasingly obvious that this will have to be done within a national framework. We foresee the need to strengthen the role of the Welsh Language Board in encouraging and facilitating a number of new partnerships to re-energise Welsh in the community. We recommend therefore that the Welsh Language Board should take direct responsibility for initiating the establishment of a National Language Resource Centre together with commissioning the research and training requirements which have been referred to earlier in this Summary Report.

5.3.2. The National Language Research Centre would have prime responsibility for the following issues:

- marketing the economic value of bilingualism to Wales, and to those businesses who are considering locating or investing here, especially within the multilingual context of the European Union;
- monitoring, supporting and transplanting practical language planning activities together with new theories in this field, by drawing on international experience;
- reviewing and providing materials which facilitate the use of Welsh, especially in relation to Welsh-medium software for the workplace;
- creating a central data base of Welsh materials so that workers can utilise examples of good working practice which may be adapted to various circumstances;
- preparing guides and materials to assist individuals and voluntary organisations to work in practical terms to promote Welsh in their communities;
- providing a support help-line which the public could use to obtain authoritative advice on the use of Welsh, for example, on how to express complex ideas when the language has to be precise e.g. in preparing a contract or a legal document;
- acting as a national information centre for translation services and other language-related services.

5.3.3. We also foresee a role for the Centre as a national data base for language planning. Research is a critical element in the processes of formulating appropriate language policies. Too often promising research is ignored or disregarded as there is no follow up or evaluation and testing undertaken by specialists in its wake. Thus, we recommend that a central
data base be established so as not to duplicate work and research and to facilitate the diffusion of information on applied bilingualism and the effectiveness of local language policies. More often than not, the research undertaken in preparation for language policies is occasional and short-term. However, there has been significant investment in this area in recent years. Now there is a need for a permanent institution equipped with a staff of professionals able to train others to oversee the area of work and policy matters in specialised domains. Rather than seeing solely a growth in the numbers able to speak Welsh or indeed with the development of new domains, we now need to see Welsh being used effectively in various public spheres such as the health services, the business sector, the voluntary sector and throughout the community. The Centre would provide an appropriate structure for such activities and one could add to the above list another responsibility, namely sponsoring or co-promoting seminars on practical aspects of language planning in Wales and in a European context, drawing on good practice from other regions such as Catalonia and the Basque Country.

5.4. Language Animateurs

5.4.1. An essential means of increasing the provision of Welsh-medium services is to create a framework which is supportive of bilingualism; that is, the processes of realising the civil rights which are incorporated in the Language Act and in the recognised charters on human rights. The core of this social change would be to deepen the fairly superficial bilingualism which currently exists and to extend it to the working environment of institutions which offer a service to the public. If providers of Welsh-medium public services are serious about their response to the recent guidelines on developing bilingual policies, then they should provide a comprehensive bilingual service rather than give the impression that this is merely a compromise. Many institutions require an external stimulus to quick start their reaction. Thus one of our principal recommendations is that the Welsh Language Board, government departments, companies and all types of institutions should develop the idea of language animateurs - individuals charged with the special responsibility of promoting the use of the language.

5.4.2. Language animateurs would function at the three levels set out below, and with varying degrees of financial support and authority:

- At the local level as social encouragers, social workers, nurses/health visitors/mid-wives, could, in some cases, accept responsibility for
making more use of Welsh whilst discharging their duties;
- Within a county or a specific region, *animateurs* could be given a wide brief to promote Welsh either completely independent of Mentrau Iaith, or as part of the preparatory work to setting up a Menter Iaith where appropriate;
- Within specific occupations or industries, language *animateurs* could work on an interim basis in for example, the police service, local authorities or health trust, the ambulance and fire services. Their role would be to establish a new bilingual framework in order to improve good practice or to prepare the ground for the implementation of workplace language plans by adopting best case examples from other sectors.

5.4.3. Regarding their role and finance, language *animateurs* could be supported by a consortium of para-public agencies e.g via the Local Government Management Board or they could be employed directly by, or in partnership with, the Welsh Language Board on fixed-term contracts e.g. 5 years, in order to prepare the ground for those Mentrau which have been planned but not established as yet.

5.4.4. Of course, there is a significant difference between a proposed plan and a fully functional bilingual service. In order to achieve such a bilingual service, language *animateurs* would have to be well trained in a variety of aspects of public sector work so as to achieve these medium term goals. By 'good practice' we mean such things as codes of behaviour, the cross-fertilisation of ideas, and the development of software being transposed from one sector to another (e.g. accountancy, social work and the like).

5.4.5. In long-anglicised areas where there is little popular support or current infra-structure for the Welsh language, there is an urgent need for clearly focused Mentrau, whose personnel could function as *animateurs* or co-organisers. However, it is vital that such *animateurs* be well trained in a number of skills and that they be fully supported by expertise and materials produced through the Welsh Language Board. One could envisage the following items being prepared for the language *animateurs* by the Board:

- an information pack which deals with the principles and practice of language planning and which includes detailed examples of both 'good practice' and 'bad practice', together with examples of successful and unsuccessful language planning;
- a comprehensive analysis of the formal responsibilities which all agencies have in relation to the promotion of Welsh, together with the
names and addresses of key contact personnel in the local target area, so that effective networking can be initiated from the beginning of the appointment of any animateur; 
• in-service training at a national level for all language animateurs. Experience of comparative and contrasting European examples would also be required in the training. Such instruction could be the shared responsibility of specific academic institutions, whilst input would also be drawn from respective Language Boards, the European Bureau for Lesser Used Languages and the European Union. The key question is who is to be the instigator of such developments? We see an obvious role for the Welsh Language Board to be the international co-ordinator in this field.

5.4.6. To achieve these aims a national network of Mentrau personnel would be necessary, one which would also associate itself with the promotion of the community leadership skills which are so urgently needed. Language-sensitive community leadership skills could be developed by an external agency such as CCETSW Wales as part of its social work training programme and we recommend that the Welsh Language Board explore this possibility. Further discussion of community training is included in the main report.

6. Realising the Potential

6.0.1. Hitherto, the focus has been upon presenting appropriate frameworks and structures for the normalisation of the language at several levels and in different communities. However, it is evident from the results described in section 2 that consideration should be given to normalisation from the standpoint of the individual, that is the user, as well as the standpoint of the service provider.

6.0.2. We believe that the greatest challenge to the normalisation of Welsh lies in the workplace. Unless this sphere is revolutionised, any 'choice' will not be available for it will not be a free choice. Language rights are not genuine if they can be exercised only as a customer and not also as a worker - this is the operation of the market and not the assertion of democratic rights per se. Thus we need continuous provision of good quality occupational education and training. Language improvement
courses are needed which will focus on language skills and the promotion of worker self-confidence, as well as courses to enable individuals to work in an effective and professional manner in both English and Welsh. A national campaign for the promotion of plain, clear and accurate Welsh would form an important element in this process.

6.0.3. The mere fact that one is fluent in Welsh does not necessarily imply that the language can be used effectively in spheres such as finance and accountancy, architecture, town and country planning, health and welfare and the like. There is a need for a high-quality, well-established infrastructure for occupational training which would evaluate courses, offer accredited certificates of qualification and prepare Welsh-medium *pro-formas* and software for use in the workplace, so that the individual need not loose confidence, nor under pressure turn back to English in frustration.

6.0.4. This is an obvious and basic message. However, the right to use Welsh will be a sham, unless and until it can be realised as a daily language in all domains through expanding the occupational provision of working bilingually.

6.0.5. It would be easy to loose heart in the face of such a challenge. Detailing the difficulties and chief barriers does not mean that we are yielding to the situation; the deficiencies which professional workers cite must be acknowledged. Unless this happens and one reacts practically, the whole strategic planning of the Welsh Language Board and other agencies will be in vain. Above all, we need to be honest in interpreting the situation and realistic in our aspirations.

6.1. What are the main barriers to Welsh in the workplace?

6.1.1. The research findings highlight many barriers which currently prevent an increase in the use of Welsh in the workplace. Among these are:

- an unaccustomed use of Welsh professionally;
- a lack of consistent and relevant terminology;
- a lack of confidence;
- a feeling of awkwardness when using Welsh in linguistically mixed contexts, either with individuals and families or with fellow-workers;
- a lack of support from managers and superiors within the establishment;
- a lack of ownership of the language;
- a deficiency in several aspects of the mastering the language, such as
its grammar and confidence in its use;
- a tension between the formal language of reports and guidelines, and
  the natural language of conversation, but this could also be true of
  English;
- a personal tension between a professional self-image and the
  individual's ability in Welsh.

6.2. What is to be done?

6.2.1. It is not the sole responsibility of the individual to solve all of the
above problems. the research findings demonstrate that very many of the
Welsh-speakers who were interviewed found it easier to use English rather
than Welsh in formal settings, because of the long-standing difference in
the status of the Welsh language in comparison with English. In order to
equalise language choice there needs to be:

- a change in attitudes through sophisticated strategic and marketing
  campaigns together with other effective methods;
- an increase in the provision of in-service training so that one may feel
totally confident in using English and Welsh equally well;
- a change in behaviour through persuasion, encouraging interest and
  increasing opportunities to use the language;
- an increase in the number who use Welsh on a daily basis, whether
  they be new speakers or passive bilinguals.

6.2.2. In an attempt to modify behaviour natural language use should be
stressed, eliminating any hindrance there may be between consumer and
provider so that both may be convinced that this may lead to a far more
effective service. A feature which is absent for many is the feeling of
fluency in the language. There is a need to nurture a feeling of contentment,
fairness and success when providing bilingual services. Both the supplier
and the recipient should be enriched by the provision of such a choice.

6.2.3. One of the principal themes of this report is the extension and
deepening of bilingualism, but first we need to ask where are the barriers
which hinder this happening:

i. In the mind: After centuries of English linguistic uniformity,
  changing attitudes towards the role of Welsh in society is a
difficult task. Although we understand the reluctance of some to
  work bilingually, the research suggests that it is not by any means
  the lack of will nor any element of anti-Welsh feeling which is the
main threat, but rather the lack of provision and habit. The opportunity for strategic planning so as to influence the public's mind-set towards the language should be grasped, especially in relation to planning for youngsters.

ii. *In our expectations:* Currently many companies and public bodies who offer an element of language choice operate a patina of superficial bilingualism. We have to change our expectations if we are to realise a vision of a bilingual Wales. The public have to be convinced that the Welsh language belongs to all and that they share a joint responsibility for its welfare. If we succeed in doing this, the working culture will have been changed and Welsh will have been saved from marginalisation. The philosophy of forward thinking movements like CCETSW is absolutely correct. It argues that "bilingualism is not a problem, but a fact, and we have to acknowledge this fact if the service which is offered is to be of a high quality and relevant".

iii. *In our civil rights:* The individual is a citizen with acknowledged rights. This is one of the main themes of the research, namely that so many of our country's inhabitants are conscious that their civil rights are not currently being upheld by the system.

iv. *In the community:* There is a need to extend the boundaries of bilingualism within the community, in the institutions and agencies which maintain the quality of life and offer better ways of coping with the myriad social problems which beset our age. The challenge facing us in Wales is to create partnerships which will enable us to share and benefit from each other's experiences. The ability to choose the language in which we would prefer to be served is but an extension of this personal and social empowering. But securing the possibility of choice is itself dependant upon national and international political underpinning.

v. *In the political sphere:* The realisation of language rights is dependant upon how responsive public bodies are to the implications of the Language Act on the one hand and to social pressure on the other. The reaction of local authorities to the need to devise a language plan is in part dependant upon their decision to allocate finance for its provision and the reaction of the people who will ultimately be affected by it, namely the electorate.
Without a positive reaction on its part, it is unlikely that local authorities will give priority to a high profile framework for Welsh. As a consequence one should not expect a uniform level of provision throughout the country. Such unevenness also characterises the response of some non-departmental public bodies in their provision of bilingual services to the public, although they do not have an electorate so to speak. To a great extent, the probable success of the Language Act will be determined by how much use is made of the bilingual provision it has occasioned. It is thus a matter of some urgency to encourage the public to use the new opportunities to their full potential and to familiarise themselves with the new arrangements.

6.2.4. All this has to be considered within a British and European context. So many of the changes which impact on Welsh derive from government policies and our situation as part of the United Kingdom. It should also be recalled that the constitutional reforms proposed for Wales will also greatly effect the legal and operative status of Welsh. Regardless of whether or not a National Assembly is established, it is evident that the official administrative profile of Welsh will increase. The effect of this will be to authorise and legitimise bilingualism as a societal norm. In common with many other European regions e.g. Catalonia, the Basque Country, Friesland and Friuli, Wales has witnessed an increase in the emphasis given to indigenous languages and regional development. In the coming years, yet more emphasis will be given to the appropriate place of lesser-used languages within the context of the core programmes of the European Union. This will give Wales a particular opportunity to play a prominent role in the formulation of European social and linguistic policies.

6.2.5. In order to extend and deepen bilingualism a holistic partnership must be forged between key agencies such as Local Authorities, Mentrau Iaith, Health Trusts, Chambers of Commerce, government departments and Crown bodies. The business world has long understood the need for holistic partnerships so as to be in a position to react flexibly to changes in the international environment. It is time to develop similar contingencies in the interests of Welsh. Antur Teifi already appreciates this and benefits from such considerations.

6.3. Changing attitudes

6.3.1. Changing attitudes begins in the education system. There is a danger that we have overloaded the education system through conceiving of it as
sole preserver and saviour of our culture. The education system has been the principal medium for historic changes in the context of the language: there is no gainsaying this, but there are dangers in presuming that schools and their teachers are the only saviour of the Welsh language, rather than being an essential element in the larger process of educating children. Without doubt, we have to ensure that the education system continues to support the development of Welsh. But there is a genuine danger that by so concentrating our attention on this we ignore the social context which education seeks to serve.

6.3.2. Welsh-medium education came to the forefront as the old relationship between the home, the chapel and the community began to weaken. To date, not one social institution has adequately filled the gap. Developments within the mass media do not assuage the same needs for social interaction, and indeed, some would argue that the media has contributed to the breakdown of social networks. To a large extent, the nature of our popular culture has been transformed since the Second World War. Because of its size, the Welsh speaking community cannot maintain the full range of its cultural activities without public subsidy. Even so, as a result of past support, there has been considerable success in the publication of novels and new books in Welsh, even though this has not been translated into the establishment of a traditional formatted daily Welsh-medium newspaper. However, as a consequence of technological developments, such as teletext, the Internet and E-mail, there is an appreciable growth in the diffusion of news items. Now is an opportune time to initiate a discussion on the possibility of establishing and financing a daily Welsh-medium newspaper using such technology.

6.3.3. And what about the cause of Welsh as a second language? Considering the demographic size of the second language population, it is certain that they should receive far more attention in the future, whether they be adult learners, parents of Welsh-medium school children, pupils encountering Welsh as part of the National Curriculum or those who were raised unable to speak Welsh by Welsh-speaking parents. Any language planning process should be able to analyse the relative success of late immersion methods and measure the contribution of centres seeking to assimilate linguistically those who are described as 'late-comers' to a community. But there is an additional need to be able to measure the success and failure of adults learning the language in formal classes, and the difficulties such learners encounter as they seek to be incorporated within Welsh-medium networks and communities.
6.3.4. In Europe there is a widespread awareness of proven and successful methods of teaching modern languages. Gradually, such methods are permeating the world of lesser-used languages. As an illustration the international network, VisioNet, supported by the Workers Educational Association augers well in this respect. One of the aims of this network is to encourage adults at all levels of linguistic competence to learn lesser-used languages. It achieves this in co-operation with other European regions with similar language-related problems, such as Brittany and the Basque Country, by developing and promoting effective and progressive teaching methods and exchanging methodological ideas and practice.

6.3.5. More detailed attention is needed on how to change the attitude and image of Welsh speakers, and the creation of educational opportunities whereby both learners and fluent speakers can improve their language skills within specific professional niches deserves close scrutiny.

6.3.6. We emphasise again the need to create a dynamic contemporary image for the language. Clearly, machine-dependent networks together with their attendant software and computers are an integral part of this process. However, this is only half the story. Nothing can replace the experience of daily interaction within a family or mass society, but the breadth of this experience is in turn dependent upon the opportunities available to the individual.

6.3.7. We need to ask what is the nature of the relationship between the individual and the infra-structure which supports our language behaviour? It is obvious that we need investment in all spheres, but are we willing to pay the price? In other words, are we asking one generation to support all the necessary changes that should have been an integral part of our national history over the centuries? What is our goal as a society? Is it a fully comprehensive bilingualism, or a fragmented version, which only seeks to achieve bilingualism within specific domains? If the answer is the former then there will be additional costs in terms of time and money, yet without this would not the millions which have already been invested in bilingual education be ineffective? There is a need for an agenda to realise language rights. There is a need for partnerships between the public, private and voluntary sectors, and professional language planners, in order to promote activities and to assist communities to create behaviour patterns which employ Welsh in all aspects of life.

6.3.8. There is much hard work ahead of us. These goals and priorities cannot be achieved without a great deal of social, political and economic
pressure. But not one of them will be worth realising unless we recognise the fundamental changes which are occurring within contemporary society. Within the context of the Welsh Language Board's Strategy, we propose the following recommendations derived from our assessment of the needs to take advantage of the potential of Welsh as a community language once again.

7. Recommendations

7.1. The Principal Recommendations

7.1.1. The concept of Mentrau Iaith should be developed and adapted to the needs of other areas in accordance with the framework proposed in section 4 of this document, and that encouragement and support be given to new Mentrau Iaith wherever it is appropriate. (Paragraph 3.6.3)

7.1.2. The concept of County Language Initiatives should be developed and implemented in accordance with the illustration discussed in section 5.1 of this document.

7.1.3. The concept of County Language Resource Centres should be developed and implemented in accordance with the framework set out in section 5.2 of this document.

7.1.4. The concept of a National Language Resource Centre should be developed and implemented in accordance with the framework set out in section 5.3 of this document.

7.1.5. A network of language *animateurs* should be established and developed in accordance with the concepts set out in section 5.4 of this document.

7.1.6. A closer relationship should be nurtured between the Welsh Language Board, the Mentrau Iaith, the local authorities, and the public, private and voluntary sectors, and effective partnerships should be established in order to expand bilingual provision and enable communities to use the language in all aspects of life through offering the public an efficient language choice. (Paragraphs 2.5.12, 6.2.3ii a 6.3.7)
7.1.7. A marketing strategy for Welsh should be devised and sustained in order to draw people to Welsh-medium networks, to encourage people to utilise the existing opportunities to use the language and to promote a dynamic, contemporary image of the language. (Paragraph 6.3.6)

7.1.8. A campaign should be launched to encourage people - especially second-language speakers- to raise their children through the medium of Welsh and to extend the natural opportunities for children and young people to socialise together and with a variety of adults both from within and outside their immediate family through the medium of Welsh. (Paragraph 2.5.4)

7.1.9. A thorough investigation should be undertaken into the successes and failures of teaching Welsh to adults, and into the problems they encounter when attempting to blend into Welsh-medium networks and communities, so that effective frameworks in this field may be constructed together with significant investment. (Paragraph 6.3.3-6.3.5)

7.1.10. Increased provision should be made for in-service language tuition (Paragraph 2.4.4); a permanent occupational training infra-structure of the highest-quality should be developed and endowed so as to facilitate the effective use of Welsh in the workplace (Paragraph 6.0.3)

7.1.11. Appropriate information packs should be produced to facilitate the process of establishing Mentrau Iaith and Language Resource Centres, and the training of community leaders and language animateurs; in particular, provision should be made for the relevant training of community leaders in particular. (Paragraphs 5.1.7, 5.2.5 and 5.4.6).

7.1.12. Consultation be undertaken with the Welsh Office with a view to re-drafting those aspects of the statutory planning process which directly impinge on attempts to regenerate Welsh as a community language. (Paragraph 2.5.8)

7.1.13. Co-operative work should be undertaken in association with the Development Board of Rural Wales (or possible future successor bodies), Menter a Busnes and Antur Teifi in order to develop several of Antur Teifi's ideas and processes so as to encourage self-sustaining economic development in other areas. (Paragraph 3.2.7)

7.2. Other recommendations
7.2.1. A campaign should be launched to increase the use of the language through the provision of software and technology.

7.2.2. A comprehensive advertising campaign should be launched to increase the awareness of existing Welsh-medium services.

7.2.3. Suppliers should provide bilingual services as a matter of course rather than requiring the citizen to specifically ask for a Welsh service.

7.2.4. A framework which is supportive of bilingualism should be created, based on the process of realising those civil rights which are incorporated within the Welsh Language Act, 1993 and recognised human rights charters.

7.2.5. More pro-active methods should be devised to persuade second-language speakers to use Welsh more frequently.

7.2.6. Closer co-operation should be developed between the Welsh Language Board and a number of professional bodies in Wales in order to realise the concept of a bilingual service, to normalise the idea of the bilingual workplace, to prepare official documents in clear, simple and correct Welsh, to standardise the terminology used by bodies which provide a bilingual service, to convince private companies and bodies that they are a critical component in the broader strategy for the Welsh language.

7.2.7. Professional research is required into the relationship between language reproduction and the town and country planning process so as to realise a more holistic perspective. Similarly, we recommend that research be undertaken into the relationship between economic development, governmental intervention (for example, through the tax system) and the future of the language.

7.2.8. Co-operation should be developed with the media so as to present effective role models for learning and using the language.

7.2.9. Consideration should be given to adopting the decalogue used for the promotion of Catalan for Welsh purposes, as follows:

i. Speak Welsh on all occasions, especially with your family and friends. Try to speak Welsh with those people who can understand the language, even if currently you are used to speaking to them in English.
ii. Be polite to those who speak another language, but insist that they show the same respect to your language.

iii. Speak Welsh with all others; on the street, on the telephone, in work and elsewhere. If the other person understands you, keep at it in Welsh, even if you get a reply in another language.

iv. Give encouragement to those members of your family who do not as yet fully comprehend Welsh by speaking slowly and explaining occasional phrases to them.

v. When someone attempts to speak Welsh give them support by showing that you appreciate their attempts.

vi. Do not over-correct other speakers; teach by example

vii. Respect the various dialects and nurture the richness of spoken Welsh.

viii. Support Welsh-medium newspapers and journals. Take advantage of all opportunities to enjoy programmes, live shows, books and modern exciting materials in Welsh.

ix. Use Welsh in your written correspondence, especially in dealings with large companies and public bodies - for example, write your cheques in Welsh. Make the Welsh language both visible and audible in your business profile, for example, in your signs, your advertisements and your messages to customers.

x. Insist on your right to use Welsh in your dealings with companies and institutions. Do this in a polite and constructive manner, and by adhering to the principles of the decalogue we will build a bilingual Wales which belongs to all.

7.2.10. The opportunity should be taken for strategic planning in order to predispose the general public toward a more favourable attitude to Welsh, paying especial attention to planning for young people.

7.2.11. The general public must be appraised of the fact that Welsh belongs to all and that all have a shared responsibility for it.

7.2.12. There is a need to extend the boundaries of bilingualism within the community, the institutions and the agencies who maintain the quality of
life and deal with social problems.

7.2.13. A discussion should be initiated on the formation and financing of a daily Welsh-medium 'newspaper' taking advantage of the latest technology such as teletext, e-mail and the Internet.

7.2.14. Welsh-medium medical and dentistry services should be made readily available wherever possible.

7.2.15. A computer generated automatic language choice should be made available for public and private customer enquiry help-lines, so that the individual does not have to specifically ask for the Welsh version. Wherever possible the Welsh-medium service should not be allocated a different number from that given for the English-medium service.

7.2.16. There is scope for specific planning to improve the marketing of the language as an economic asset and as an integral part of Welsh-medium communities.

7.2.17. Local authorities should increase their provision for the teaching of Welsh as a second language.